

 **DRAFT Minutes**
Chinatown Working Group Meeting
March 2, 2019, 6:30pm, 275 Cherry Street Community Room

Voting members present: Art Against Displacement (Francisca Benitez, Vanessa Thill); Chinese Staff and Workers Association (Vincent Cao, Zishun Ning); National Mobilization Against Sweatshops (Steph Kranes, Briar Winters).

Also present: Michael Cohen (Citygroup); rob hollander (Lower East Side Residents for Responsible Development); Fannie Ip (East River Park Action); Michael Perles (Democratic Socialists of America); Loan Tran (resident).

Meeting called to order, 6:40 pm, Michael Perles (DSA) facilitating.

FEBRUARY MINUTES

February Minutes approved by all present without objection.

AGENDA

Visualization

Law suit next steps

Candidate endorsements

Town Hall

Plan updates

VISUALIZATION

There are 30 different groups of people who want to get involved. We're holding an information center on Saturday. Then the participants will come with their visualizations before the next CWG meeting.

Members recommend that the affordable housing be indicated in the visualization. The visual of the current zoning should include hotel development (C6) and the shadows.

LAW SUIT NEXT STEPS

Developers have appealed. If DCP issues findings, the Coalition can initiate another law suit. The pledge is intended to move the community.

Question: Should NYCHA residents have control over what is developed in NYCHA, or should CWG make those decisions? Should CWG be facilitative or authoritative?

We'll produce a document with all the chosen options and a list of updates as an addendum to the Pratt document.

CANDIDATE ENDORSEMENTS

We won't endorse until the pledge has had wide circulation so we can prioritize the plan over candidates.

TOWN HALL

Steph and Joann are still looking for a venue for the town hall.

Poster once we get a venue.

LEFT FORUM

Still waiting for approval. It will be held at LIU Brooklyn near Fort Greene, end of May.

We could hold an event like the one we did at the library with organizers across the city.

Rob will propose a second panel for Citygroup.

PLAN UPDATES

We looked at rob's list of updates. He'll look at the footnotes, if there are any. We'll create an addendum clarifying which options CWG voted on and the demographic updates.

BYLAWS

According to the old quorum, any resolution requires 15 votes to pass or a majority of the majority of the total membership, whichever is greater. If we can get 15 members to a meeting, we can change the quorum.

ADDENDA

1. List of needed updates.
2. List of active members.
3. List of CWG plan options

1. List of needed updates (reprinted from February)

Bold=would be useful or necessary to update (imo) (-:

p8.

Local Area Median Income: then \$37,362 for a family of four. Today?

Ethnic Chinese population loss since 2010.

\$934/mnth was affordable to AMI (30% of local AMI above).

Current rents? Pratt found \$2,750 listed on Pitt St.; \$3,395 at Market & Madison.

12,256 NYCHA units in the study area. (There's been privatization since.)

On the waiting list for public housing 2013: 167,353 families; plus 123,533 waiting for section 8. Today?

p9.

85% renter-occupied units in the study area. 56% rent burdened in the core of Chinatown (plan does indicate whether this refers to area A or a wider area).

Regulated rents went for as much as \$2,500 (compared with 934/mnth for AMI rent burden). Today?

p10

9,000 rent regulated units lost 2002-2008 and 5,890 affordable units (to 80% of AMI) lost 2008-2011. How many lost since?

p11

real estate assessments for real estate taxes

p13

percent of renters report being harassed by landlord

p25

employment data (is this essential to the plan?)

p26

industry forecasts (declines: grocery, foodprep, jewelry and apparel mfg)

population of ethnic Chinese decline 2000-2010 -18.9%

Household expenditures Chinatown: \$536,096,709; retail sales: \$1,125,325,942; surplus sales (sales to outsiders) \$589,229,232. (Important because it demonstrates that Chinatown is an economically viable, thriving community)

p72

ethnic populations (should be easily obtained from CB3 website district profile)

p.75

CD3 list 9,000 rent regulated units lost between 2002 and 2008 (repeated data from p10)

p79

Anti-displacement: median rents in CD3 \$1,713 for recent movers compared with \$895 all renters. 37% rent burdened. median rent current \$3,500

p100

current local AMI; 50% of local ami to accord with the local median income

appendix:

soft sites on website <https://chinatownlerproject.tumblr.com/>. (Document requires some app I don't have, so I'll look at it later.)

The historical resources (landmarkable sites) are listed in the appendix. It would be rhetorically useful to identify any that have been demolished, but landmarking was not included in the CWG recommendations (as distinct from the Pratt recommendations). The local Chinese small landlords vigorously opposed landmarking and the Coalition pointedly took no position on landmarking, preferring downzoning as a more unified approach to community preservation and anti-displacement.

2. List of active members

1. 83-85 Bowery Tenants Association
2. 229 Henry Street Tenants Association
3. 318 Restaurant Workers
4. Art against Displacement (AAD)

5. Bowery Alliance of Neighbors (BAN)
6. Chinese Staff and Workers Association (CSWA)
7. Lands End Residents Association 2
8. Lower East Side Organized Neighbors (LESON)
9. Lower East Side United Neighborhood Association (LESUNA)
10. Mujeres y Hombres Luchadoras
11. National Mobilization against Sweatshops (NMASS)
12. Sixth Street Community Center
13. Youth against Displacement (YAD)

Not yet applied:

Citygroup

Lower Manhattan Housing Committee of Democratic Socialists of America
(LowMan-DSA)

East River Park Action (ERPA)

and AALDEF -- hasn't attended in quite a while.

3. List of CWG plan options

Subdistrict A- Option 1

Subdistrict B - Option 2

Subdistrict C - no options, keep existing zoning w modifications

Subdistrict D - Option 2

Subdistrict E1 - Option 1

Subdistrict E2 Option 1